

Item No. 2

Application Reference Number P/21/1155/2

Application Type:	Listed Building Consent	Date Valid:	29/6/2021
Applicant:	Mr and Mrs Tandon		
Proposal:	Erection of two storey side extension and associated internal alterations.		
Location:	The Spinneys Brand Lane Woodhouse Eaves LE12 8TY		
Parish:	Woodhouse	Ward:	Forest Bradgate
Case Officer:	Lewis Marshall	Tel No:	07714 846497

Background

This application has been brought to plans committee as it has been called in by Cllr Snartt for the following reasons:

- The proposed design conflicts with policies CS2 and CS14
- Potential harm to and loss of trees
- Impact on neighbouring amenity
- There are both objections against and support for the application and believe it is right that it be determined by the Plans Committee

Description of the Application Site

The site contains a large detached dwelling built in the Arts and Crafts style believed to date from 1901. The Spinneys is a large detached house situated in grounds at the end of a long drive off Brand Lane. It has an irregular shape on plan consisting of the family rooms at the north end and the service rooms at the south end, partly arranged around an open yard, now enclosed, with a late C20 conservatory adjoining the west side. Externally, the building is faced with brick, rendered or painted, all in white, with roughcast render between the sections of applied timber-framing. The dressings are of ashlar stone, and the roof covering of Swithland slate laid in diminishing courses is from the nearby Swithland quarry. The building was grade II listed in July 2019 following the submission of an application to demolish the building and replace it with a new dwelling.

The site is one of a number of large houses that make up The Brand area of the Woodhouse Eaves Conservation area. The site is heavily wooded and as such the building cannot be seen from Brand Lane or any other public vantage points. Trees across the site frontage to Brand Lane are protected by tree preservation order. The nearest un-associated dwelling is its former coach house now under different ownership and occupied independently on its south-east side. The site is located in the countryside outside of the defined settlement limits of Woodhouse Eaves and lies outside of the National Forest.

Description of the Proposal

The application seeks listed building consent for the demolition of part of the existing dwelling and conservatory and construction of a two storey side extension with associated internal alterations. A separate planning application for the proposed extensions and alterations to the main house and grade II listed building is considered under application reference P/21/1079/2. The proposed extension seeks to replace part of an existing later service wing and C20 upvc conservatory with a modernist contemporary interventionist wing to contrast the irregular, informal and picturesque style of the original house. The proposal also includes some reconfiguration of the space internally to provide an addition that is suitable for modern day single unit family living and to upgrade the house generally to remedy issues of damp and deterioration.

Development Plan Policies

Charnwood Local Plan Core Strategy (adopted 9 November 2015)

Policy CS14 - Heritage - sets out to conserve and enhance our historic assets for their own value and the community, environmental and economic contribution they make.

Other material considerations

The National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF 2021)

The NPPF sets out the government's view of what sustainable development means. It is a material consideration in planning decisions and contains a presumption in favour of sustainable development. For planning decisions this means approving proposals that comply with an up to date development plan without delay. If the Development Plan is silent or policies most relevant to determining the application are out of date permission should be granted unless protective policies within the NPPF give a clear reason for refusal or any adverse impacts would significantly and demonstrably outweigh the benefits, when assessed against the NPPF as a whole.

Section 16 – Conserving and Enhancing the Historic Environment

In determining applications local planning authorities should take account of the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets and putting them to viable uses consistent with their conservation. Where a development proposal will lead to less than substantial harm to the significance of the heritage asset, the harm should be weighed against the public benefit,

Planning Practice Guidance

This national document provides additional guidance to ensure the effective implementation of the planning policy set out in the National Planning Policy Framework.

The TCPA Listed Building and Conservation Areas Act 1990

Section 66 of the Town and Country Planning (Listed Building and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 requires that special regard shall be had for preserving and enhancing listed buildings and their settings.

Equality Act 2010

Section 149 places a statutory duty on public authorities in the exercise of their functions to have due regard to the need to eliminate discrimination and advance equality.

The Draft Charnwood Local Plan 2021-37

The Draft Charnwood Local Plan is at an early stage in its preparation and underwent a six-week pre-submission consultation period that ran from Monday July 12 until Monday August 23, 2021. This document carries only very limited weight at this time.

Consultation Responses

The table below sets out the responses that have been received from consultees with regard to the application. Please note that these can be read in full on the Council's website www.charnwood.gov.uk

Consultee	Response
Charnwood Design and Conservation	<p>Supports the application and overall concludes that the harm to the listed building is minor and less than substantial, which is outweighed by the public benefits which in this case are;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• Attend to the significant deterioration of the building fabric, thus ensuring its long-term future.• Upgrade and extend the living accommodation to promote its longevity as a single-family occupation dwellinghouse and preserve its significance as a heritage asset for the future.• Take account of the desirability of sustaining and enhancing the significance of heritage assets, continuing their viable use consistent with their conservation.
Woodhouse Parish Council	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• The listed feature such as wood panelling and staircase should be protected.• Not confident that sympathetic alterations will be made due to history of applications on the site

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The listed building should remain as the dominant feature on the site • Scale and design of the extensions must not overwhelm the original Arts and Crafts building or interfere with its narrative – extensions seem to be extensive. • Objects to the flat roof extension to the front which is unattractive • No objection to two small trees nearest the house but request that measures are taken to protect remaining trees.
Ward Councillor Snartt	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The proposed design conflicts with policies CS2 and CS14 • Potential harm to and loss of trees • Impact on neighbouring amenity • There are both objections against and support for the application and believe it is right that it be determined by the Plans Committee
Historic England	Does not wish to offer any comments. Suggest that the LPA seek the views of your specialist conservation and archaeological advisers, as relevant.

Other Comments Received

2 letters of support have been received from local residents. The list below summarises the areas of support for the application.

- The proposals which respect the original core of the Arts and Crafts house whilst removing and replacing later alterations and extensions with a high quality and replacement.
- Later additions to be removed detract from the building and replace with one extension which will be an improvement to the existing.
- The building cannot be seen and will not have any impact on the surrounding area

Planning History

The following planning history is that which is most recent and relevant to the proposal:

P/19/0952/2 - Demolition of existing detached dwelling and construction of new six bedroom detached dwelling. This application was refused.

Consideration of the Planning Issues

The starting point for decision making on all planning applications is that they must be made in accordance with the adopted Development Plan unless material

considerations indicate otherwise. The most relevant policies for the determination of this application are listed above and are contained within the Development Plan for Charnwood which comprises the Charnwood Local Plan 2011-2028 Core Strategy (2015), those “saved” policies within the Borough of Charnwood Local Plan 1991-2026 (2004) which have not been superseded by the Core Strategy. It is acknowledged that several of these plans are over 5 years old; therefore it is important to take account of changing circumstances affecting the area, or any relevant changes in national policy. With the exception of those policies which relate to the supply of housing, the relevant policies listed above are up to date and compliant with national advice. Accordingly there is no reason to reduce the weight given to them, in this regard.

The main issues are considered to be:

- Heritage
- Other matters

Heritage

Policy CS14 of the Core Strategy seeks to conserve heritage assets and their settings. Paragraph 190 of the National Planning Policy framework states that Local planning authorities should identify and assess the particular significance of any heritage asset that may be affected by a proposal (including by development affecting the setting of a heritage asset) taking account of the available evidence and any necessary expertise. The site is not identified within the Woodhouse Neighbourhood Plan as a heritage asset and as such is not subject to any specific heritage policies within the neighbourhood plan.

In the case of determining planning applications, Section 66 of the Town and Country Planning (Listed building and Conservation areas) Act 1990 requires that special regard shall be had for preserving and enhancing listed buildings and their settings.

The Listed Building

The building appears on the 1903 ordinance survey map and is thought to be of Edwardian construction in a distinctive Arts and Crafts style.

Many original features exist both internally and externally, including a mullioned main entrance, sweeping staircase, wooden panelling and parquet flooring which contribute to its historic significance. Full records of the building’s internal and external features that remain are set out within Historic England’s Listing Inspectors Report and within the submitted Heritage Statement. It is therefore acknowledged that The Spinneys represents a rare and exciting discovery of a building with true historic and architectural significance and all efforts should be made to secure its future.

A key aspect to consider in respect of the listed building is the proposed partial demolition of the service wing and the C20 conservatory. It is clear from studying the original architect’s plans, that the garages, stores and external staircase to the south of the building are later modifications and additions. The existing conservatory is a

late 20th century installation that is of very poor quality and is an unsympathetic addition to the original building. The removal of the conservatory and the small external staircase flight would be a positive aspect of the proposals and would be considered to improve the appearance and character of the building. The later extensions to the house included a 1st floor Study accessed via an extension to the staircase landing, built over a ground floor Store. Although these are not contemporary with the original Arts & Crafts building and are not of the same build quality, they are part of the history and development of the house and represent a time in the history of the house when additional accommodation was required to suit the needs of the owners at that time. As such, the removal of these elements would be considered to result in harm. The level of this harm is considered to be at the low end of the scale but, nevertheless, this has to be balanced against any public benefit in the overall planning balance. The internal and external proposed alterations to the existing listed building are considered below

The Basement

This area of the building is of less significance than the other parts of the building, nevertheless, care has been taken to retain the important elements that are considered to have architectural and/or historic significance. The need to address the central heating system and the current damp/flooding issues within the basement is accepted. The existing internal face of the external wall to the basement does not contain any significant features, accordingly the proposed internal thermal lining of these walls is acceptable.

The Ground floor

The listing description identifies that the interior of the building has a similar high standard of design to the exterior, demonstrating the fine craftsmanship and use of good quality materials typical of Arts & Crafts houses. The suite of reception rooms is almost wholly intact and the plan form is still legible.

It is accepted that the concrete floor to the Drawing Room (referred to as Lounge in application) requires lifting and a new floor constructed. Any important original floor coverings, such as parquet are to be carefully removed for relaying. It is also noted that that features such as architraves/skirting boards and the panelled window seat to the east bay window are to be carefully protected and retained.

The enlargement of the door opening to the 'Entrance Hall' as proposed is considered to be acceptable and would mitigate the harm that would have been caused by the impact on the plan-form and the loss of internal wall panelling to the entrance hall, important features described in the listing details. Whilst there would still be some alteration by realigning the door, this is considered acceptable.

The lobby to the south end of the servant's staircase enclosure is considered to be part of the later additions and the removal of this is considered acceptable. The formation of an opening to the south wall of the Dining Room to provide connectivity to the kitchen is considered acceptable and would result in less impact on the original plan-form of the building and is more conducive to modern family living.

The First Floor

It is a positive aspect of the scheme that the built-in cupboards to the corridor have been retained. The opening up of the east Bathroom to form an open seating area is considered to be an improvement, resulting in less impact on the plan-form and on historic fabric.

The more minor alterations to internal walls and the erection of new lightweight partitions to facilitate the installation of ensuite bathrooms as indicated on the plan would, subject to more detailed drawings and specifications (subject to conditions), be considered acceptable.

The Second Floor

The formation of a new bedroom and bathroom would appear to involve minimal loss of historic fabric and impact on plan form. Subject to final details (subject to conditions), this would be considered acceptable.

The Exterior

It is noted that the chimney stack to the south elevation is not considered to be an original feature and has been replaced insensitively at some point. It is, nevertheless an important element and provides balance to the composition of the house. The dismantling of this and rebuilding in reclaimed bricks to match the other, more subservient stacks would be acceptable and is a positive aspect of the scheme.

The installation of conservation style rooflights to the rear elevation, whilst allowing a degree of natural light, it is not considered that this would significantly impact on the ambience of the internal staircase or on the overall composition of the west elevation not result in the unacceptable loss of historic fabric. There is a small degree of harm associated with this aspect of the scheme.

Overall, it is considered that the proposals would conserve the building as a heritage asset in accordance with Policy CS14 of the Core Strategy (2015).

In accordance with section 16 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, it is considered that the proposal would preserve the listed building its setting and features of special architectural or historic interest which it possesses. It is therefore considered positively in relation to the duty under that section of The 1990 Act.”

The overall harm identified in respect of the above mentioned heritage assets is considered to be very minor and less than substantial. In accordance with Paragraph 202 of the National Planning Policy Framework, where there is less than substantial harm to a heritage asset, this should be weighed against the public benefits of the proposal. This assessment is set out in the conclusion and planning balance below.

Other Matters

Concerns have been raised in respect of highway safety, ecology, amenity and trees. However, the scope of such matters cannot be considered under the listed building consent application as the considerations are limited to the impact on the

heritage asset only. These matters are considered under the associated planning application.

Conclusion and Planning Balance

It is considered that the development would cause minor and less than substantial harm to the significance of heritage assets (the listed building and its setting). However in accordance with paragraph 202 of the National Planning Policy Framework, it is considered that the public benefits of the proposal when considered overall outweigh the less than substantial harm. The public benefits are acknowledged to be the creation of a more sustainable dwelling in the long term and ephemeral construction jobs during the construction process. Adapting the building to suit modern day living will ensure its longevity as a single occupation dwelling house and therefore preserve its significance as a heritage asset for the future, which is given positive weight. These benefits are given positive weight and outweigh the harm which has been identified to the designated heritage asset, that being the listed building and its setting.

Overall the application is therefore recommended for approval subject to conditions.

RECOMMENDATION:-

This planning permission is granted subject to the following Conditions and Reasons why they are imposed

1.	The works must be begun not later than the expiration of three years beginning with the date on which consent is hereby granted. REASON: To comply with Section 18 of the Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990 (as amended by Section 51 of the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004)
2.	The development hereby permitted shall be carried out in accordance with the following approved plans: 20.209.S01.09 A 20.209.S03.10 A 20.209.S03.01 20.209.S03.02 20.209.S03.03 20.209.S03.04 20.209.S03.05 20.209.S03.06 20.209.S03.07 20.209.S03.08 20.209.S03.11 20.209.S03.12

	REASON: To provide certainty and define the terms of the permission
3.	<p>Prior to the installation of the new heating system, detailed drawings together with a method statement clearly describing the system and how services pipes, conduits etc. are to be distributed and fixed shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority. The heating system shall thereafter be installed in accordance with the approved drawings.</p> <p>REASON: to ensure the new heating system does not result in the unacceptable harm or loss of building fabric that contributes to the significance of the listed building in accordance with Policy CS14</p>
4.	<p>Prior to the removal of any internal fabric and features, detailed drawings and specifications of alterations to internal walls and the erection of new lightweight partitions and any internal doors and associated detailing shall be submitted to and approved by the local planning authority. the development shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details and specifications.</p> <p>REASON: to limit the loss of internal historic fabric and mitigate the impact of the development on the heritage asset.</p>

Informative Note(s):

1. Listed building consent has been granted for this development because the Council has determined that it is generally in accordance with the terms of Development Plan policy CS14. There are no other issues arising that would indicate that listed building consent should be refused.
2. The Local Planning Authority has acted pro-actively through early engagement with the Applicant at the pre-application stage and throughout the consideration of this application. This has led to improvements with regards the development scheme in order to secure a sustainable form of development in line with the requirements of Paragraph 38 of the National Planning Policy Framework (2019), in accordance with the Town and Country Planning (Development Management Procedure) (England) Order 2015 and in accordance with the Town and Country Planning (Listed buildings and Conservation areas) Act 1990.

